

| | |
|--|--|
| | |
|--|--|

- [Query](#)
- [Reports](#)
- [Utilities](#)
- [Logout](#)

CLOSED

**District Court of the Virgin Islands
District of the Virgin Islands (St. Thomas Division)
CIVIL DOCKET FOR CASE #: 3:08-cv-00159-JRS -GWB**

Vento et al
Assigned to: US District Judge Juan R Sanchez
Referred to: US Magistrate Judge Geoffrey W. Barnard
Cause: 05:552 Freedom of Information Act

Date Filed: 12/30/2008
Date Terminated: 05/23/2011
Jury Demand: None
Nature of Suit: 895 Freedom of
Information Act
Jurisdiction: U.S. Government Defendant

Plaintiff

Richard Vento

represented by **Marjorie R. Roberts**
Erika A. Kellerhals, PC
P.O. Box 608
St Thomas, VI 00804
340-776-7235
Fax: 340-776-7951
Email: jorie@marjorierobertspc.com
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Johanna Harrington
Marjorie Rawls Roberts, P.C.
1 Hibiscus Alley
St.Thomas, VI 00802
340-776-7235
Fax: 340-776-7951
Email: johanna@marjorierobertspc.com
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Joseph A DiRuzzo , III
Fuerst Ittleman, PL
1001 Brickell Bay Drive Suite 3200
Miami, FL 33131
305.350.5690
Fax: 305.371.8989
Email: jdiruzzo@fuerstlaw.com

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

Lana Vento

represented by **Marjorie R. Roberts**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Johanna Harrington
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Joseph A DiRuzzo , III
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

Gail Vento

represented by **Marjorie R. Roberts**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Johanna Harrington
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Joseph A DiRuzzo , III
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

V.

Defendant

Internal Revenue Service

represented by **Gerald Alan Role**
Tax Division, U.S Department of Justice
P O Box 227
Washington, DC 20044
202-307-0461
Fax: 202-514-6866
Email: gerald.a.role@usdoj.gov
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Joycelyn Hewlett
U.S. Attorney's Office
Ron De Lugo Federal Bldg
5500 Veterans Drive, Suite 260
St Thomas, VI 00802
340-774-5757
Fax: 340-776-3474
Email: joycelyn.hewlett@usdoj.gov
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

| Date Filed | # | Docket Text |
|------------|--------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| 12/30/2008 | <u>1</u> | COMPLAINT <i>For Declaratory And Injunctive Relief</i> against Internal Revenue Service filed by Richard Vento, Lana Vento, Gail Vento. (Roberts, Marjorie) (Additional attachment(s) added on 1/6/2009: # <u>1</u> Civil Cover Sheet) (KAB). (Entered: 12/30/2008) |
| 01/06/2009 | | Filing fee: \$ 50.00, receipt number 063995 (KAB) (Entered: 01/06/2009) |
| 01/06/2009 | <u>2</u> | Summons Issued as to Internal Revenue Service. (KAB) (Entered: 01/06/2009) |
| 01/07/2009 | 3 | ORDER REASSIGNING CASE (CVG) dated 1/7/2009 It is hereby ORDERED that, effective immediately, this matter is reassigned to the Honorable Judge Juan R. Sanchez. (This is a TEXT ENTRY ONLY. There is no.pdf document associated with this entry.) (BAF) (Entered: 01/07/2009) |
| 03/10/2009 | <u>4</u> | ANSWER to <u>1</u> Complaint by Defendant Internal Revenue Service. (Role, Gerald) (Entered: 03/10/2009) |
| 03/10/2009 | <u>5</u> | CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE by Internal Revenue Service re <u>4</u> Answer to Complaint (Role, Gerald) (Entered: 03/10/2009) |
| 03/26/2009 | <u>6</u> | NOTICE of Appearance by Joycelyn Hewlett on behalf of Defendant Internal Revenue Service (Hewlett, Joycelyn) (Entered: 03/26/2009) |
| 04/02/2009 | <u>7</u> | AFFIDAVIT of Service for Complaint <i>For Declaratory and Inj. Rel.</i> served on A.M. Gulas on 1.8.09, filed by Richard Vento, Lana Vento, Gail Vento. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Affidavit Process Server Aff.) (Roberts, Marjorie) (Entered: 04/02/2009) |
| 04/08/2009 | <u>8</u> | ORDER (JRS)4/8/2009.A status /case management Video/Telephone-Conference shall take place on April 28,2009, at 2:00 p.m. EST (in Dallas,Texas: 1:00 p.m. CST) to discuss the items listed in the following Agenda. (Correa, Joel) (Entered: 04/15/2009) |

| | | |
|------------|----------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| 04/22/2009 | 9 | AMENDED ORDER (JRS) that court's April 8, 2009 scheduling order is amended only to the extent that counsel shall attend and participate in the newly assigned room (CBF) (Entered: 04/22/2009) |
| 04/28/2009 | 1 0 | NOTICE of Appearance by Joseph A DiRuzzo, III on behalf of Plaintiffs Richard Vento, Lana Vento, Gail Vento (DiRuzzo, Joseph) (Entered: 04/28/2009) |
| 04/28/2009 | 1 1 | Minute Entry for proceedings held before US District Judge Juan R Sanchez: Video Teleconference was held on 4/28/2009. (Correa, Joel) (Entered: 05/08/2009) |
| 05/12/2009 | 1 2 | ORDER (JRS) dated 5/12/2009. That in this cause of action under the Freedom of Information Act ("FOIA"), 5 U.S.C. 552, et seq., as amended, there will be no formal discovery under the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure. Defendant Internal Revenue Service (IRS) shall produce no later than July 12, 2009 (60 days from the date of this Order), either: (a) a Vaughn index pursuant to Vaughn v. Rosen, 484 F.2d 820; or in the alternative, (b) an affidavit from the IRS detailing how the IRS complied with the FOIA in the accordance with the requests of Plaintiffs Richard Vento, Lana Vento, and Gail Vento. The parties shall file dispositive motions with the Court no later than September 10, 2009 (120 days from the date this Order). (Correa, Joel) (Entered: 05/13/2009) |
| 09/07/2009 | 1 3 | MOTION for Leave to File Excess Pages by Plaintiffs Richard Vento, Lana Vento, Gail Vento. (Attachments: # 1 Text of Proposed Order) (DiRuzzo, Joseph) (Entered: 09/07/2009) |
| 09/09/2009 | 1 4 | ORDER (JRS) dated 9/9/09 granting 13 Motion for Leave to File Excess Pages (KAB) (Entered: 09/09/2009) |
| 09/09/2009 | 1 5 | MOTION for Summary Judgment by Plaintiffs Richard Vento, Lana Vento, Gail Vento. (Attachments: # 1 Text of Proposed Order) (DiRuzzo, Joseph) (Entered: 09/09/2009) |
| 09/10/2009 | 1 6 | STATEMENT OF UNDISPUTED FACTS in Support re 15 MOTION for Summary Judgment filed by Plaintiffs Richard Vento, Lana Vento, Gail Vento. (Attachments: # 1 Exhibit A, # 2 Exhibit B, # 3 Exhibit C, # 4 Exhibit D, # 5 Exhibit E, # 6 Exhibit F, # 7 Exhibit G, # 8 Exhibit H, # 9 Errata I, # 10 Exhibit J, # 11 Exhibit K, # 12 Exhibit L, # 13 Exhibit M, # 14 Exhibit N, # 15 Exhibit O, # 16 Exhibit P, # 17 Exhibit Q, # 18 Exhibit R) (DiRuzzo, Joseph) (Entered: 09/10/2009) |
| 09/10/2009 | 1 7 | MEMORANDUM in Support re 15 MOTION for Summary Judgment filed by Plaintiffs Richard Vento, Lana Vento, Gail Vento. (Attachments: # 1 Exhibit A, # 2 Exhibit B, # 3 Exhibit C, # 4 Exhibit D, # 5 Exhibit E, # 6 Exhibit F, # 7 Exhibit G, # 8 Exhibit H, # 9 Exhibit I, # 10 Exhibit J, # 11 Exhibit K, # 12 Exhibit L, # 13 Exhibit M, # 14 Exhibit N, # 15 Exhibit O, # 16 Exhibit P, # 17 Exhibit Q, # 18 Appendix A, # 19 Appendix B, # 20 Appendix C) (DiRuzzo, Joseph) (Entered: 09/10/2009) |

| | | |
|------------|------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| 09/10/2009 | <u>1</u> <u>8</u> | MOTION for Extension of Time to File <i>Motion for Summary Judgment</i> by Defendant Internal Revenue Service. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Text of Proposed Order, # <u>2</u> Certificate of Service) (Role, Gerald) (Entered: 09/10/2009) |
| 09/14/2009 | <u>1</u> <u>9</u> | ORDER (JRS) dated 9/14/2009 That the Motion of Defendant Internal Revenue Service In re: <u>18</u> is GRANTED, and Defendant shall be allowed to file its motion and brief in support of summary judgment on September 14, 2009. (JRC) (Entered: 09/14/2009) |
| 09/14/2009 | <u>2</u> <u>0</u> | MOTION for Summary Judgment by Defendant Internal Revenue Service. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Certificate of Service) (Role, Gerald) (Entered: 09/14/2009) |
| 09/14/2009 | <u>2</u> <u>1</u> | STATEMENT OF UNDISPUTED FACTS in Support re <u>20</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment filed by Defendant Internal Revenue Service. (Role, Gerald) (Entered: 09/14/2009) |
| 09/14/2009 | <u>2</u> <u>2</u> | MEMORANDUM in Support re <u>20</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment filed by Defendant Internal Revenue Service. (Role, Gerald) (Entered: 09/14/2009) |
| 09/14/2009 | <u>2</u> <u>3</u> | Affidavit in Support re <u>20</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment (<i>Declaration of Kathleen Brewer</i>) filed by Defendant Internal Revenue Service. (Role, Gerald) (Entered: 09/14/2009) |
| 09/14/2009 | <u>2</u> <u>4</u> | Affidavit in Support re <u>20</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment (<i>1st Declaration of Channpreet K Singh</i>) filed by Defendant Internal Revenue Service. (Role, Gerald) (Entered: 09/14/2009) |
| 09/14/2009 | <u>2</u> <u>5</u> | Affidavit in Support re <u>20</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment (<i>2d Declaration of Channpreet K Singh</i>) filed by Defendant Internal Revenue Service. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A : Log of Withheld Documents) (Role, Gerald) (Entered: 09/14/2009) |
| 09/14/2009 | <u>2</u> <u>6</u> | Affidavit in Support re <u>20</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment (<i>Declaration of Gerald A. Role</i>) filed by Defendant Internal Revenue Service. (Role, Gerald) (Entered: 09/14/2009) |
| 09/28/2009 | <u>2</u> <u>7</u> | NOTICE of negotiated extension to file responses to motions for summary judgment by Internal Revenue Service re <u>17</u> Memorandum in Support to Motion,, <u>20</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment, <u>15</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment, <u>26</u> Affidavit in Support of Motion, <u>23</u> Affidavit in Support of Motion, <u>25</u> Affidavit in Support of Motion, <u>21</u> Statement of Undisputed Facts in Support of Motion, <u>16</u> Statement of Undisputed Facts in Support of Motion, <u>22</u> Memorandum in Support to Motion, <u>24</u> Affidavit in Support of Motion (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Certificate of Service) (Role, Gerald) (Entered: 09/28/2009) |

| | | |
|------------|---------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| 10/13/2009 | <u>28</u> | Opposition to Motion re <u>20</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment filed by Plaintiffs Richard Vento, Lana Vento, Gail Vento. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Response to Stat. of Material Facts) (DiRuzzo, Joseph)(Filer advised to re-file the attached document as a separate document) Modified on 10/14/2009 (JRC). (Entered: 10/13/2009) |
| 10/14/2009 | <u>29</u> | REPLY to re <u>28</u> Opposition to Motion filed by Plaintiff Gail Vento, Plaintiff Lana Vento, Plaintiff Richard Vento filed by Plaintiffs Richard Vento, Lana Vento, Gail Vento. Responses due by 10/27/2009 (DiRuzzo, Joseph) (Entered: 10/14/2009) |
| 10/16/2009 | <u>30</u> | Opposition to Motion re <u>15</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment filed by Defendant Internal Revenue Service. (Role, Gerald) (Entered: 10/16/2009) |
| 10/16/2009 | <u>31</u> | REPLY to re <u>16</u> Statement of Undisputed Facts in Support of Motion, filed by Plaintiff Gail Vento, Plaintiff Lana Vento, Plaintiff Richard Vento filed by Defendant Internal Revenue Service. Responses due by 10/29/2009 (Role, Gerald) (Entered: 10/16/2009) |
| 10/30/2009 | <u>32</u> | REPLY to Opposition to Motion re <u>30</u> Opposition to Motion filed by Plaintiffs Richard Vento, Lana Vento, Gail Vento. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A-1, # <u>2</u> Exhibit A-2) (DiRuzzo, Joseph) (Entered: 10/30/2009) |
| 03/31/2010 | <u>33</u> | ORDER (JRS) dated 3/31/10 Granting pltf's motion for summary judgment (Dock 15) in part and denied in part. (LT) (Entered: 03/31/2010) |
| 03/31/2010 | <u>34</u> | MEMORANDUM OPINION(JRS) dated 3/31/10 (CBF) (Entered: 04/01/2010) |
| 04/07/2010 | <u>35</u> | ORDER (JRS) dated 4/6/2010. Teleconference shall take place on April 15,2010 at 1:00 p.m.Counsel for Virgin Islands Bureau of Internal Revenue is to initiate the call.Only lead counsel for each party is required to participate in the teleconference. (JRC) (Entered: 04/07/2010) |
| 04/30/2010 | <u>36</u> | AFFIDAVIT (<i>Declaration</i>) of Jacqueline M. Moss by Internal Revenue Service. (Role, Gerald) (Entered: 04/30/2010) |
| 04/30/2010 | <u>37</u> | AFFIDAVIT (<i>Declaration</i>) of Glendsey Tucker by Internal Revenue Service. (Role, Gerald) (Entered: 04/30/2010) |
| 04/30/2010 | <u>38</u> | AFFIDAVIT (<i>Declaration</i>) of Channpreet K. Singh by Internal Revenue Service. (Role, Gerald) (Entered: 04/30/2010) |
| 05/21/2010 | <u>39</u> | STATUS REPORT <i>Joint Status Report</i> by Internal Revenue Service, Gail Vento, Lana Vento, Richard Vento. (DiRuzzo, Joseph) (Entered: 05/21/2010) |

| | | |
|------------|----------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| 04/18/2011 | 4 0 | ORDER (JRS) dated 4/18/11 the parties shall submit a joint status report no later than 4/26/11.If the parties agree this action should be voluntarily dismissed,they may file a joint stipulation of dismissal in lieu of a status report (KAB) (Entered: 04/19/2011) |
| 04/29/2011 | 4 1 | STATUS REPORT by Internal Revenue Service. (Role, Gerald) (Entered: 04/29/2011) |
| 04/29/2011 | 4 2 | CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE by Internal Revenue Service re 41 Status Report (Role, Gerald) (Entered: 04/29/2011) |
| 05/02/2011 | 4 3 | NOTICE of Appearance by Johanna Harrington on behalf of Plaintiffs Gail Vento, Lana Vento, Richard Vento (Harrington, Johanna) (Entered: 05/02/2011) |
| 05/20/2011 | 4 4 | STIPULATION of Dismissal by Internal Revenue Service. (Role, Gerald) (Entered: 05/20/2011) |
| 05/23/2011 | 4 5 | Civil Case Closed-Stipulation purst to Rule 41 (JRC). (Entered: 05/24/2011) |

| | | | |
|-----------------------------|---------------|-------------------------|------------------------|
| PACER Service Center | | | |
| Transaction Receipt | | | |
| 09/23/2011 11:07:44 | | | |
| PACER Login: | pb0232 | Client Code: | foiaproj |
| Description: | Docket Report | Search Criteria: | 3:08-cv-00159-JRS -GWB |
| Billable Pages: | 5 | Cost: | 0.40 |